

# Package ‘endogeneity’

January 16, 2025

**Type** Package

**Title** Recursive Two-Stage Models to Address Endogeneity

**Version** 2.1.4

**Date** 2025-01-16

**Maintainer** Jing Peng <jing.peng@uconn.edu>

**Description** Various recursive two-stage models to address the endogeneity issue of treatment variables in observational study or mediators in experiments. The details of the models are discussed in Peng (2023) <[doi:10.1287/isre.2022.1113](https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113)>.

**License** GPL (>= 3)

**Encoding** UTF-8

**VignetteBuilder** knitr

**Imports** Rcpp, pbivnorm, maxLik, statmod, MASS, data.table

**LinkingTo** Rcpp, RcppArmadillo

**Suggests** knitr, rmarkdown

**RoxygenNote** 7.3.2

**NeedsCompilation** yes

**Author** Jing Peng [aut, cre]

**Repository** CRAN

**Date/Publication** 2025-01-16 16:30:01 UTC

## Contents

bilinear . . . . .	2
biprobit . . . . .	4
biprobit_latent . . . . .	6
biprobit_partial . . . . .	9
endogeneity . . . . .	11
linear_probit . . . . .	13
pln . . . . .	15
pln_linear . . . . .	17

pln_probit . . . . .	19
probit_linear . . . . .	22
probit_linearRE . . . . .	24
probit_linear_latent . . . . .	27
probit_linear_partial . . . . .	29

<b>Index</b>	<b>32</b>
--------------	-----------

---

bilinear	<i>Recursive Bivariate Linear Model</i>
----------	---

---

### Description

Estimate two linear models with bivariate normally distributed error terms.

First stage (Linear):

$$m_i = \alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + \lambda u_i$$

Second stage (Linear):

$$y_i = \beta' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

The identification of this model requires an instrumental variable that appears in  $\mathbf{w}$  but not  $\mathbf{x}$ . This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

### Usage

```
bilinear(form1, form2, data = NULL, par = NULL, method = "BFGS", verbose = 0)
```

### Arguments

form1	Formula for the first linear model
form2	Formula for the second linear model
data	Input data, a data frame
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "1" means first stage variables.
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `var_bhhh`: BHHH covariance matrix, inverse of the outer product of gradient at the maximum
- `se_bhhh`: BHHH standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

**References**

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

**See Also**

Other endogeneity: `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

**Examples**

```

library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = -1 + x + z + e1
y = -1 + x + m + e2

est = bilinear(m~x+z, y~x+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

```

biprobit

*Recursive Bivariate Probit Model***Description**

Estimate two probit models with bivariate normally distributed error terms.

First stage (Probit):

$$m_i = 1(\alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Probit):

$$y_i = 1(\beta' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i > 0)$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

$w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. Identification can be weak if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ . This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```
biprobit(form1, form2, data = NULL, par = NULL, method = "BFGS", verbose = 0)
```

**Arguments**

form1	Formula for the first probit model
form2	Formula for the second probit model
data	Input data, a data frame
par	Starting values for estimates

method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "1" means first stage variables.
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `var_bhhh`: BHHH covariance matrix, inverse of the outer product of gradient at the maximum
- `se_bhhh`: BHHH standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

### References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

**See Also**

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

**Examples**

```
library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + z + e1 > 0)
y = as.numeric(1 + x + z + m + e2 > 0)

est = biprobit(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)
```

---

biprobit\_latent

*Recursive Bivariate Probit Model with Latent First Stage*


---

**Description**

Estimate two probit models with bivariate normally distributed error terms, in which the dependent variable of the first stage model is unobserved.

First stage (Probit,  $m_i^*$  is unobserved):

$$m_i^* = 1(\boldsymbol{\alpha}'\mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Probit):

$$y_i = 1(\boldsymbol{\beta}'\mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i^* + \sigma v_i > 0)$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

$w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. The identification of this model is generally weak, especially if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ .  $\gamma$  is assumed to be positive to ensure that the model estimates are unique.

**Usage**

```
biprobit_latent(
  form1,
  form2,
  data = NULL,
  EM = FALSE,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  verbose = 0,
  maxIter = 500,
  tol = 1e-05,
  tol_LL = 1e-06
)
```

**Arguments**

form1	Formula for the first probit model, in which the dependent variable is unobserved. Use a formula like ~w to avoid specifying the dependent variable.
form2	Formula for the second probit model, the latent dependent variable of the first stage is automatically added as a regressor in this model
data	Input data, a data frame
EM	Whether to maximize likelihood use the Expectation-Maximization (EM) algorithm, which is slower but more robust. Defaults to FALSE, but should change to TRUE if the model has convergence issues.
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>
maxIter	max iterations for EM algorithm
tol	tolerance for convergence of EM algorithm
tol_LL	tolerance for convergence of likelihood

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "1" means first stage variables.
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.

- var: covariance matrix
- se: standard errors
- gradient: Gradient function at maximum
- hessian: Hessian matrix at maximum
- gthg:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- LL or maximum: Likelihood
- AIC: AIC
- BIC: BIC
- n\_obs: Number of observations
- n\_par: Number of parameters
- iterations: number of iterations taken to converge
- message: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

## References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

## See Also

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + z + e1 > 0)
y = as.numeric(1 + x + z + m + e2 > 0)

est = biprobit(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)
```



```
est_latent = biprobit_latent(~x+z, y~x+z)
print(est_latent$estimates, digits=3)
```

---

biprobit_partial	<i>Recursive Bivariate Probit Model with Partially Observed First Stage</i>
------------------	---

---

### Description

Estimate two probit models with bivariate normally distributed error terms, in which the dependent variable of the first stage model is partially observed (or unobserved).

First stage (Probit,  $m_i$  is partially observed):

$$m_i = 1(\boldsymbol{\alpha}'\mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Probit):

$$y_i = 1(\boldsymbol{\beta}'\mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i > 0)$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

Unobserved  $m_i$  should be coded as NA.  $w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. Identification can be weak if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ . Observing  $m_i$  for 10%~20% of observations can significantly improve the identification of the model.

### Usage

```
biprobit_partial(
  form1,
  form2,
  data = NULL,
  EM = FALSE,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  verbose = 0,
  maxIter = 500,
  tol = 1e-05,
  tol_LL = 1e-06
)
```

### Arguments

form1	Formula for the first probit model, in which the dependent variable is partially observed.
form2	Formula for the second probit model, the partially observed dependent variable of the first stage is automatically added as a regressor in this model (do not add manually)
data	Input data, a data frame

EM	Whether to maximize likelihood use the Expectation-Maximization (EM) algorithm, which is slower but more robust. Defaults to FALSE, but should change to TRUE is the model has convergence issues.
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>
maxIter	max iterations for EM algorithm
tol	tolerance for convergence of EM algorithm
tol_LL	tolerance for convergence of likelihood

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of maxLik

- estimates: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "1" means first stage variables.
- estimate or par: Point estimates
- variance\_type: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- var: covariance matrix
- se: standard errors
- gradient: Gradient function at maximum
- hessian: Hessian matrix at maximum
- gtHg:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- LL or maximum: Likelihood
- AIC: AIC
- BIC: BIC
- n\_obs: Number of observations
- n\_par: Number of parameters
- iterations: number of iterations taken to converge
- message: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of maxLik. See the documentation of maxLik for more details.

## References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

## See Also

Other endogeneity: [bilinear\(\)](#), [biprobit\(\)](#), [biprobit\\_latent\(\)](#), [linear\\_probit\(\)](#), [pln\\_linear\(\)](#), [pln\\_probit\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\(\)](#), [probit\\_linearRE\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\\_latent\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\\_partial\(\)](#)

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
N = 5000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + 3*z + e1 > 0)
y = as.numeric(1 + x + z + m + e2 > 0)

est = biprobit(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

# partially observed version of m
observed_pct = 0.2
m_p = m
m_p[sample(N, N*(1-observed_pct))] = NA
est_partial = biprobit_partial(m_p~x+z, y~x+z)
print(est_partial$estimates, digits=3)
```

---

endogeneity

*Recursive two-stage models to address endogeneity*

---

## Description

This package supports various recursive two-stage models to address the endogeneity issue. The details of the implemented models are discussed in Peng (2022). In a recursive two-stage model, the dependent variable of the first stage is also the endogenous variable of interest in the second stage. The endogeneity is captured by the correlation in the error terms of the two stages.

Recursive two-stage models can be used to address the endogeneity of treatment variables in observational study and the endogeneity of mediators in experiments.

The first-stage supports linear model, probit model, and Poisson lognormal model. The second-stage supports linear and probit models. These models can be used to address the endogeneity of continuous, binary, and count variables. When the endogenous variable is binary, it can be unobserved or partially unobserved, but the identification can be weak.

### Functions

bilinear: recursive bivariate linear model

biprobit: recursive bivariate probit model

biprobit\_latent: recursive bivariate probit model with latent first stage

biprobit\_partial: recursive bivariate probit model with partially observed first stage

linear-probit: recursive linear-probit model

probit\_linear: recursive probit-linear model

probit\_linear\_latent: recursive probit-linear model with latent first stage

probit\_linear\_partial: recursive probit-linear model with partially observed first stage

probit\_linearRE: recursive probit-linearRE model in which the second stage is a panel linear model with random effects

pln: Poisson lognormal (PLN) model

pln\_linear: recursive PLN-linear model

pln\_probit: recursive PLN-probit model

### References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

linear\_probit

*Recursive Linear-Probit Model***Description**

Estimate linear and probit models with bivariate normally distributed error terms.

First stage (Linear):

$$m_i = \alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + \sigma u_i$$

Second stage (Probit):

$$y_i = 1(\beta' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + v_i > 0)$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

The identification of this model requires an instrumental variable that appears in  $w$  but not  $x$ . This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```
linear_probit(
  form_linear,
  form_probit,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
  verbose = 0
)
```

**Arguments**

form_linear	Formula for the linear model
form_probit	Formula for the probit model
data	Input data, a data frame
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
init	Initialization method
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `var_bhhh`: BHHH covariance matrix, inverse of the outer product of gradient at the maximum
- `se_bhhh`: BHHH standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g' H^{-1} g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

**References**

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

**See Also**

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

**Examples**

```

library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = 1 + x + z + e1
y = as.numeric(1 + x + m + e2 > 0)

est = linear_probit(m~x+z, y~x+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

```

pIn

*Poisson Lognormal Model***Description**

Estimate a Poisson model with a log-normally distributed heterogeneity term, which is also referred to as the Poisson-Normal model.

$$E[y_i|x_i, u_i] = \exp(\alpha' \mathbf{x}_i + \lambda u_i)$$

The estimates of this model are often similar to those of a negative binomial model.

**Usage**

```

pIn(
  form,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
  H = 20,
  verbose = 0
)

```

**Arguments**

form	Formula
data	Input data, a data frame

par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm.
init	Initialization method
H	Number of quadrature points
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for the heterogeneity term  $\lambda = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

### References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>



**Examples**

```

library(MASS)
N = 2000
set.seed(1)

# Works well when the variance of the normal term is not overly large
# When the variance is very large, it tends to be underestimated
x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)
y = rpois(N, exp(-1 + x + z + 0.5 * rnorm(N)))
est = pln(y~x+z)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

```

---

pln\_linear

*Recursive PLN-Linear Model*


---

**Description**

Estimate a Poisson Lognormal model and a linear model with bivariate normally distributed error/heterogeneity terms.

First stage (Poisson Lognormal):

$$E[m_i | w_i, u_i] = \exp(\boldsymbol{\alpha}' \mathbf{w}_i + \lambda u_i)$$

Second stage (Linear):

$$y_i = \boldsymbol{\beta}' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

This model is typically well-identified even if  $w$  and  $x$  are the same set of variables. This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```

pln_linear(
  form_pln,
  form_linear,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
  H = 20,
  verbose = 0
)

```

**Arguments**

<code>form_pln</code>	Formula for the first-stage Poisson lognormal model
<code>form_linear</code>	Formula for the second-stage linear model
<code>data</code>	Input data, a data frame
<code>par</code>	Starting values for estimates
<code>method</code>	Optimization algorithm.
<code>init</code>	Initialization method
<code>H</code>	Number of quadrature points
<code>verbose</code>	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "pln" means first stage variables.
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

## References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

## See Also

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = rpois(N, exp(1 + x + z + e1))
y = 1 + x + m + e2

est = pln_linear(m~x+z, y~x+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)
```

---

pln\_probit

*Recursive PLN-Probit Model*

---

## Description

Estimate a Poisson Lognormal model and a Probit model with bivariate normally distributed error/heterogeneity terms.

First stage (Poisson Lognormal):

$$E[m_i | w_i, u_i] = \exp(\boldsymbol{\alpha}' \mathbf{w}_i + \lambda u_i)$$

Second stage (Probit):

$$y_i = 1(\boldsymbol{\beta}' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i > 0)$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

This model is typically well-identified even if  $w$  and  $x$  are the same set of variables. This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```
pln_probit(
  form_pln,
  form_probit,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
  H = 20,
  verbose = 0
)
```

**Arguments**

form_pln	Formula for the first-stage Poisson lognormal model
form_probit	Formula for the second-stage probit model
data	Input data, a data frame
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Without gradient, NM is much faster than BFGS
init	Initialization method
H	Number of quadrature points
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals. Prefix "pln" means first stage variables.
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.

- LL or maximum: Likelihood
- AIC: AIC
- BIC: BIC
- n\_obs: Number of observations
- n\_par: Number of parameters
- LR\_stat: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- LR\_p: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- iterations: number of iterations taken to converge
- message: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of maxLik. See the documentation of maxLik for more details.

## References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

## See Also

Other endogeneity: [bilinear\(\)](#), [biprobit\(\)](#), [biprobit\\_latent\(\)](#), [biprobit\\_partial\(\)](#), [linear\\_probit\(\)](#), [pIn\\_linear\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\(\)](#), [probit\\_linearRE\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\\_latent\(\)](#), [probit\\_linear\\_partial\(\)](#)

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = rpois(N, exp(-1 + x + z + e1))
y = as.numeric(1 + x + z + log(1+m) + e2 > 0)

est = pIn_probit(m~x+z, y~x+z+log(1+m))
print(est$estimates, digits=3)
```

probit\_linear

*Recursive Probit-Linear Model***Description**

Estimate probit and linear models with bivariate normally distributed error terms.

First stage (Probit):

$$m_i = 1(\boldsymbol{\alpha}'\mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Linear):

$$y_i = \boldsymbol{\beta}'\mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

w and x can be the same set of variables. Identification can be weak if w are not good predictors of m. This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```
probit_linear(
  form_probit,
  form_linear,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
  verbose = 0
)
```

**Arguments**

form_probit	Formula for the probit model
form_linear	Formula for the linear model
data	Input data, a data frame
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
init	Initialization method
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

**Value**

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `var_bhhh`: BHHH covariance matrix, inverse of the outer product of gradient at the maximum
- `se_bhhh`: BHHH standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `LR_stat`: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- `LR_p`: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- `iterations`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

**References**

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

**See Also**

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

**Examples**

```

library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + z + e1 > 0)
y = 1 + x + z + m + e2

est = probit_linear(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

```

---

probit\_linearRE

*Recursive Probit-LinearRE Model*


---

**Description**

A panel extension of the probit\_linear model. The first stage is a probit model at the individual level. The second stage is a panel linear model at the individual-time level with individual-level random effects. The random effect is correlated with the error term in the first stage.

First stage (Probit):

$$m_i = 1(\alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Panel linear model with individual-level random effects):

$$y_{it} = \beta' \mathbf{x}_{it} + \gamma m_i + \lambda v_i + \sigma \epsilon_{it}$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

This model uses Adaptive Gaussian Quadrature to overcome numerical challenges with long panels.  $w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. Identification can be weak if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ . This model still works if the first-stage dependent variable is not a regressor in the second stage.

**Usage**

```

probit_linearRE(
  form_probit,
  form_linear,
  id,
  data = NULL,
  par = NULL,

```



```

method = "BFGS",
H = 20,
stopUpdate = F,
init = c("zero", "unif", "norm", "default")[4],
verbose = 0
)

```

### Arguments

form_probit	Formula for the probit model at the individual level
form_linear	Formula for the linear model at the individual-time level
id	group id, character if data supplied or numerical vector if data not supplied
data	Input data, must be a data.table object
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
H	Number of quadrature points
stopUpdate	Adaptive Gaussian Quadrature disabled if TRUE
init	Initialization method
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of maxLik

- estimates: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- estimate or par: Point estimates
- variance\_type: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- var: covariance matrix
- se: standard errors
- var\_bhhh: BHHH covariance matrix, inverse of the outer product of gradient at the maximum
- se\_bhhh: BHHH standard errors
- gradient: Gradient function at maximum
- hessian: Hessian matrix at maximum
- gtHg:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- LL or maximum: Likelihood

- AIC: AIC
- BIC: BIC
- n\_obs: Number of observations
- n\_par: Number of parameters
- time: Time takes to estimate the model
- LR\_stat: Likelihood ratio test statistic for  $\rho = 0$
- LR\_p: p-value of likelihood ratio test
- iterations: number of iterations taken to converge
- message: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of maxLik. See the documentation of maxLik for more details.

## References

Chen, H., Peng, J., Li, H., & Shankar, R. (2022). Impact of Refund Policy on Sales of Paid Information Services: The Moderating Role of Product Characteristics. Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=4114972>.

## See Also

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linear_latent()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
library(data.table)
N = 500
period = 5
obs = N*period
rho = -0.5
set.seed(100)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

t = rep(1:period, N)
id = rep(1:N, each=period)
w = rnorm(N)
m = as.numeric(1+w+e1>0)
m_long = rep(m, each=period)

x = rnorm(obs)
y = 1 + x + m_long + rep(e2, each=period) + rnorm(obs)

dt = data.table(y, x, id, t, m=rep(m, each=period), w=rep(w, each=period))

est = probit_linearRE(m~w, y~x+m, 'id', dt)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)
```

---

 probit\_linear\_latent *Recursive Probit-Linear Model with Latent First Stage*


---

### Description

Latent version of the Probit-Linear Model.

First stage (Probit,  $m_i^*$  is unobserved):

$$m_i^* = 1(\alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Linear):

$$y_i = \beta' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i^* + \sigma v_i$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

$w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. The identification of this model is generally weak, especially if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ .  $\gamma$  is assumed to be positive to ensure that the model estimates are unique.

### Usage

```
probit_linear_latent(
  form_probit,
  form_linear,
  data = NULL,
  EM = TRUE,
  par = NULL,
  method = "BFGS",
  verbose = 0,
  maxIter = 500,
  tol = 1e-06,
  tol_LL = 1e-08
)
```

### Arguments

form_probit	Formula for the first-stage probit model, in which the dependent variable is latent
form_linear	Formula for the second stage linear model. The latent dependent variable of the first stage is automatically added as a regressor in this model
data	Input data, a data frame
EM	Whether to maximize likelihood use the Expectation-Maximization (EM) algorithm, which is slower but more robust. Defaults to TRUE.
par	Starting values for estimates
method	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
verbose	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>
maxIter	max iterations for EM algorithm
tol	tolerance for convergence of EM algorithm
tol_LL	tolerance for convergence of likelihood

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g.,  $<1e-3$  or  $1e-6$ ) indicates good convergence.
- `LL` or `maximum`: Likelihood
- `AIC`: AIC
- `BIC`: BIC
- `n_obs`: Number of observations
- `n_par`: Number of parameters
- `iter`: number of iterations taken to converge
- `message`: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

### References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

### See Also

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_partial()`

**Examples**

```

library(MASS)
N = 2000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + z + e1 > 0)
y = 1 + x + z + m + e2
est = probit_linear(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

est_latent = probit_linear_latent(~x+z, y~x+z)
print(est_latent$estimates, digits=3)

```

---

probit\_linear\_partial *Recursive Probit-Linear Model with Partially Observed First Stage*

---

**Description**

Partially observed version of the Probit-Linear Model.

First stage (Probit,  $m_i$  is partially observed):

$$m_i = 1(\alpha' \mathbf{w}_i + u_i > 0)$$

Second stage (Linear):

$$y_i = \beta' \mathbf{x}_i + \gamma m_i + \sigma v_i$$

Endogeneity structure:  $u_i$  and  $v_i$  are bivariate normally distributed with a correlation of  $\rho$ .

Unobserved  $m_i$  should be coded as NA.  $w$  and  $x$  can be the same set of variables. Identification can be weak if  $w$  are not good predictors of  $m$ . Observing  $m_i$  for a small proportion of observations (e.g., 10~20%) can significantly improve the identification of the model.

**Usage**

```

probit_linear_partial(
  form_probit,
  form_linear,
  data = NULL,
  EM = TRUE,

```

```

par = NULL,
method = "BFGS",
verbose = 0,
maxIter = 500,
tol = 1e-06,
tol_LL = 1e-08
)

```

### Arguments

<code>form_probit</code>	Formula for the first-stage probit model, in which the dependent variable is partially observed
<code>form_linear</code>	Formula for the second stage linear model. The partially observed dependent variable of the first stage is automatically added as a regressor in this model (do not add manually)
<code>data</code>	Input data, a data frame
<code>EM</code>	Whether to maximize likelihood use the Expectation-Maximization (EM) algorithm, which is slower but more robust. Defaults to TRUE.
<code>par</code>	Starting values for estimates
<code>method</code>	Optimization algorithm. Default is BFGS
<code>verbose</code>	A integer indicating how much output to display during the estimation process. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• &lt;0 - No output</li> <li>• 0 - Basic output (model estimates)</li> <li>• 1 - Moderate output, basic output + parameter and likelihood in each iteration</li> <li>• 2 - Extensive output, moderate output + gradient values on each call</li> </ul>
<code>maxIter</code>	max iterations for EM algorithm
<code>tol</code>	tolerance for convergence of EM algorithm
<code>tol_LL</code>	tolerance for convergence of likelihood

### Value

A list containing the results of the estimated model, some of which are inherited from the return of `maxLik`

- `estimates`: Model estimates with 95% confidence intervals
- `estimate` or `par`: Point estimates
- `variance_type`: covariance matrix used to calculate standard errors. Either BHHH or Hessian.
- `var`: covariance matrix
- `se`: standard errors
- `gradient`: Gradient function at maximum
- `hessian`: Hessian matrix at maximum
- `gtHg`:  $g'H^{-1}g$ , where  $H^{-1}$  is simply the covariance matrix. A value close to zero (e.g., <math>1e-3</math> or <math>1e-6</math>) indicates good convergence.

- LL or maximum: Likelihood
- AIC: AIC
- BIC: BIC
- n\_obs: Number of observations
- n\_par: Number of parameters
- iterations: number of iterations taken to converge
- message: Message regarding convergence status.

Note that the list inherits all the components in the output of `maxLik`. See the documentation of `maxLik` for more details.

## References

Peng, Jing. (2023) Identification of Causal Mechanisms from Randomized Experiments: A Framework for Endogenous Mediation Analysis. *Information Systems Research*, 34(1):67-84. Available at <https://doi.org/10.1287/isre.2022.1113>

## See Also

Other endogeneity: `bilinear()`, `biprobit()`, `biprobit_latent()`, `biprobit_partial()`, `linear_probit()`, `pln_linear()`, `pln_probit()`, `probit_linear()`, `probit_linearRE()`, `probit_linear_latent()`

## Examples

```
library(MASS)
N = 1000
rho = -0.5
set.seed(1)

x = rbinom(N, 1, 0.5)
z = rnorm(N)

e = mvrnorm(N, mu=c(0,0), Sigma=matrix(c(1,rho,rho,1), nrow=2))
e1 = e[,1]
e2 = e[,2]

m = as.numeric(1 + x + z + e1 > 0)
y = 1 + x + z + m + e2
est = probit_linear(m~x+z, y~x+z+m)
print(est$estimates, digits=3)

# partially observed version of m
observed_pct = 0.2
m_p = m
m_p[sample(N, N*(1-observed_pct))] = NA
est_latent = probit_linear_partial(m_p~x+z, y~x+z)
print(est_latent$estimates, digits=3)
```

# Index

## \* endogeneity

- bilinear, [2](#)
  - biprobit, [4](#)
  - biprobit\_latent, [6](#)
  - biprobit\_partial, [9](#)
  - linear\_probit, [13](#)
  - pln\_linear, [17](#)
  - pln\_probit, [19](#)
  - probit\_linear, [22](#)
  - probit\_linear\_latent, [27](#)
  - probit\_linear\_partial, [29](#)
  - probit\_linearRE, [24](#)
- bilinear, [2](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#), [26](#), [28](#), [31](#)
- biprobit, [3](#), [4](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#), [26](#), [28](#), [31](#)
- biprobit\_latent, [3](#), [6](#), [6](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#),  
[26](#), [28](#), [31](#)
- biprobit\_partial, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [9](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#),  
[26](#), [28](#), [31](#)
- endogeneity, [11](#)
- linear\_probit, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [13](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#), [26](#),  
[28](#), [31](#)
- pln, [15](#)
- pln\_linear, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [17](#), [21](#), [23](#), [26](#), [28](#),  
[31](#)
- pln\_probit, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [19](#), [23](#), [26](#), [28](#),  
[31](#)
- probit\_linear, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [22](#), [26](#),  
[28](#), [31](#)
- probit\_linear\_latent, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#),  
[21](#), [23](#), [26](#), [27](#), [31](#)
- probit\_linear\_partial, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#),  
[21](#), [23](#), [26](#), [28](#), [29](#)
- probit\_linearRE, [3](#), [6](#), [8](#), [11](#), [14](#), [19](#), [21](#), [23](#),  
[24](#), [28](#), [31](#)